

1 Stephen M. Doniger, Esq. (SBN 179314)  
2 stephen@donigerlawfirm.com  
3 Scott Alan Burroughs, Esq. (SBN 235718)  
4 scott@donigerlawfirm.com  
5 Trevor W. Barrett, Esq. (SBN 287174)  
6 tbarrett@donigerlawfirm.com  
7 Justin M. Gomes, Esq. (SBN 301793)  
8 jgomes@donigerlawfirm.com  
9 DONIGER / BURROUGHS  
603 Rose Avenue  
Venice, California 90291  
Telephone: (310) 590-1820

10 Attorneys for Plaintiff

11  
12 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
13 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

14 VALFRÉ, LLC, a California Limited  
15 Liability Company,

16 Plaintiff,

17  
18 v.

19 RUE21, INC., a Delaware Corporation;  
20 and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,  
21 Defendants.

Case No.:

**PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT FOR:**

1. COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT;
2. VICARIOUS AND/OR CONTRIBUTORY COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT;
3. COMMON LAW UNFAIR COMPETITION
4. VIOLATION OF 17 U.S.C. §1202

**Jury Trial Demanded**

22  
23  
24 Plaintiff, by and through its undersigned attorneys, hereby prays to this  
25 honorable Court for relief and remedy based on the following:  
26  
27  
28

## **INTRODUCTION**

Valfré is a fashion and design company that creates unique and eclectic clothing pieces, accessories, and stationery items. Valfré's designs are witty and original, which provides an advantage in a highly competitive marketplace. Rue 21 is a retailer that developed, distributed, marketed, and sold products that incorporate without permission original Valfré designs. This is an action for copyright infringement.

## **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

1. This action arises under the Copyright Act of 1976, Title 17 U.S.C., § 101 *et seq.*, and California Business and Professions Code Sections 17200 *et seq.*

2. This Court has federal question jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and § 1338 (a) and (b), and ancillary jurisdiction over the attendant claims.

3. Venue in this judicial district is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(c) and 1400(a) in that this is the judicial district in which a substantial part of the acts and omissions giving rise to the claims occurred.

## **PARTIES**

4. VALFRE, LLC ("VALFRE") is a California limited liability company.

5. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendant RUE21, INC. ("RUE21"), is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the state of Delaware, and is doing business in and with the state of California.

6. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that some Defendants, DOES 1 through 3, inclusive, are manufacturers and/or vendors of accessories, which have manufactured and/or supplied and are manufacturing and/or supplying accessories comprised of Plaintiff's proprietary designs (as hereinafter defined) without Plaintiff's knowledge or consent or have contributed to said infringement. The true names, whether corporate, individual or otherwise of Defendants DOES 1 through 3, inclusive, are presently unknown to Plaintiff, which therefore sues said

1 Defendants by such fictitious names and will seek leave to amend this complaint to  
2 show their true names and capacities when same have been ascertained.

3 7. Defendants DOES 4 through 10, inclusive, are other parties not yet  
4 identified who have infringed Plaintiff's copyrights, have contributed to the  
5 infringement of Plaintiff's copyrights, or have engaged in one or more of the  
6 wrongful practices alleged herein. The true names, whether corporate, individual or  
7 otherwise, of Defendants 4 through 10, inclusive, are presently unknown to Plaintiff,  
8 which therefore sues said Defendants by such fictitious names, and will seek leave to  
9 amend this Complaint to show their true names and capacities when same have been  
10 ascertained.

11 8. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that at all times  
12 relevant hereto each of the Defendants was the agent, affiliate, officer, director,  
13 manager, principal, alter-ego, and/or employee of the remaining Defendants and was  
14 at all times acting within the scope of such agency, affiliation, alter-ego relationship  
15 and/or employment; and actively participated in or subsequently ratified and  
16 adopted, or both, each and all of the acts or conduct alleged, with full knowledge of  
17 all the facts and circumstances, including, but not limited to, full knowledge of each  
18 and every violation of Plaintiff's rights and the damages to Plaintiff proximately  
19 caused thereby.

20 **CLAIMS RELATED TO 100% BOYS' TEARS DESIGN**

21 9. Plaintiff created a certain design, depicted below, which is titled "100%  
22 Boys' Tears" ("Subject Design A"). VALFRE registered Subject Design A with  
23 United States Copyright Office.

24 10. VALFRE offered Subject Design A for sale to the public before the acts  
25 alleged herein. VALFRE currently offers the design on several different products,  
26 and though the material and product type varies slightly among those, the design  
27 remains substantially the same with regard to the total image and overall appearance,  
28

1 reflected in such features as the size, shape and colors of the design, as well as the  
2 selection, sizing, shape, array, spatial design, text, and orientation and arrangement  
3 of its design elements.

4 **Subject Design A:**





13 11. Plaintiff owns in exclusivity the copyrights related to Subject Design A, as  
14 well as all attendant reproduction, adaptation, importation, marketing, and  
15 distribution rights.

16 12. The design and ornamentation of Subject Design A, including without  
17 limitation the total image and overall appearance reflected in such features as the  
18 size, shape and colors of the design, as well as the selection, sizing, shape, array,  
19 spatial design, orientation and arrangement of its design elements, as well as the text,  
20 are distinctive and original to the author.

21 **DEFENDANTS' INFRINGING CONDUCT**

22 13. Defendants, and each of them, were and are manufacturing, purchasing,  
23 distributing, importing, advertising, and selling for profit accessories that are at least  
24 substantially similar to, and infringe VALFRE's rights in, Subject Design A  
25 (hereinafter "Infringing Design").

26 14. Depicted below is a true and correct comparison of Subject Design A and  
27 the Infringing Design sold by Defendants, and each of them.

SUBJECT DESIGN A	INFRINGEMENT DESIGN A
	

15. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that the Infringing Design was manufactured, developed, imported, marketed, sold, and distributed by RUE21 and/or DOE Defendants.

16. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that RUE21 and/or DOE Defendants, purchased and/or obtained the Infringing Design from DOE Defendants, and then distributed, advertised, and/or sold the Infringing Design to their customers.

17. Upon information and belief, the Infringing Design has been widely promoted, marketed, offered for sale, sold and distributed throughout the United States, including within this district.

18. Upon information and belief, the activities of Defendants complained of herein are continuing, and constitute willful and intentional infringement of Plaintiff's copyright and are in total disregard of Plaintiff's rights.



1           24. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that one or more of  
2 the Defendants manufactures accessories and/or is an accessories vendor. Plaintiff is  
3 further informed and believes and thereon alleges that said Defendant(s) has an  
4 ongoing business relationship with other Defendants and supplied accessories to  
5 other Defendants, which accessories infringed Subject Design A, in that said  
6 accessories were composed of a design that was identical or substantially similar to  
7 Subject Design A.

8           25. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants, and  
9 each of them, infringed Plaintiff's copyrights by procuring, creating, making and/or  
10 developing directly infringing and/or derivative works from Plaintiff's designs,  
11 including without limitation Subject Design A, and by importing, producing,  
12 distributing and/or selling infringing accessories through a nationwide network of  
13 customers, retail stores, catalogues and through on-line websites. This conduct  
14 violated Plaintiff's exclusive rights in Subject Design A.

15           26. Due to Defendants' acts of infringement, Plaintiff has suffered substantial  
16 damages to its business in an amount to be established at trial.

17           27. Due to Defendants' acts of infringement, Plaintiff has suffered general and  
18 special damages in an amount to be established at trial.

19           28. Due to Defendants' acts of copyright infringement as alleged herein,  
20 Defendants, and each of them, have obtained direct and indirect profits they would  
21 not otherwise have realized but for their infringement of Subject Design A. As such,  
22 Plaintiff is entitled to disgorgement of Defendants' profits directly and indirectly  
23 attributable to Defendants' infringement of Subject Design A in an amount to be  
24 established at trial.

25           29. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants, and  
26 each, infringed Plaintiff's copyrights with knowledge that Plaintiff owned the  
27 exclusive rights in Subject Design A, and that Defendants' acts described herein  
28



1 constituted infringement, and/or that Defendants, and each, were reckless in  
2 committing the infringement alleged herein. Per the above, Defendants' acts of  
3 copyright infringement as alleged above were, and continue to be, willful, intentional  
4 and malicious, subjecting Defendants, and each of them, to liability for statutory  
5 damages under Section 504(c)(2) of the Copyright Act in the sum of up to one  
6 hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) per infringement, and/or to being  
7 precluded from claiming certain cost deductions from their disgorgeable profits and  
8 from asserting certain affirmative defenses.

9 **SECOND CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

10 **(For Vicarious and/or Contributory Copyright Infringement - Against All**  
11 **Defendants, and Each)**

12 30. Plaintiff repeats, realleges and incorporates herein by reference as though  
13 fully set forth the allegations contained in the preceding paragraphs, inclusive, of this  
14 Complaint.

15 31. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants  
16 knowingly induced, participated in, aided and abetted in and profited from the illegal  
17 reproduction and/or subsequent sales of accessories featuring Subject Design A as  
18 alleged hereinabove.

19 32. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants, and  
20 each of them, are vicariously liable for the infringement alleged herein because they  
21 had the right and ability to supervise the infringing conduct and because they had a  
22 direct financial interest in the infringing conduct.

23 33. By reason of the Defendants', and each of their, acts of contributory  
24 infringement as alleged above, Plaintiff has suffered and will continue to suffer  
25 substantial damages to its business in an amount to be established at trial, as well as  
26 additional general and special damages in an amount to be established at trial.



1           34. Due to Defendants' acts of copyright infringement as alleged herein,  
2 Defendants, and each of them, have obtained direct and indirect profits they would  
3 not otherwise have realized but for their infringement of Subject Design A. As such,  
4 Plaintiff is entitled to disgorgement of Defendants' profits directly and indirectly  
5 attributable to Defendants' infringement of Subject Design A, in an amount to be  
6 established at trial.

7           35. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants, and  
8 each, infringed Plaintiff's copyrights with knowledge that Plaintiff owned the  
9 exclusive rights in Subject Design A, and that Defendants' acts described herein  
10 constituted infringement, and/or that Defendants, and each, were reckless in  
11 committing the infringement alleged herein. Per the above, Defendants' acts of  
12 copyright infringement as alleged above were, and continue to be, willful, intentional  
13 and malicious, subjecting Defendants, and each of them, to liability for statutory  
14 damages under Section 504(c)(2) of the Copyright Act in the sum of up to one  
15 hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) per infringement, and/or to being  
16 precluded from claiming certain cost deductions from their disgorgeable profits and  
17 from asserting certain affirmative defenses.

18                                   **THIRD CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

19                   **(Common Law Unfair Competition – Against All Defendants, and Each)**

20           36. Plaintiff repeats, realleges and incorporates herein by reference as though  
21 fully set forth the allegations contained in the preceding paragraphs, inclusive, of this  
22 Complaint.

23           37. Defendants' conduct as alleged herein, including their unlawful replication  
24 and imitation of the look and feel of VALFRE's design, particularly VALFRE's  
25 iPhone cases bearing Subject Design A, was calculated to deceive or confuse the  
26 public and to profit Defendants unjustly from the goodwill and reputation of  
27

1 Plaintiff. Defendants' actions constitute unfair competition under the laws of the  
2 State of California.

3 38. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants' unfair competition,  
4 Plaintiff has incurred and continues to incur substantial damages in an amount to be  
5 established at trial.

6 39. As a direct and proximate result of the willful and wanton actions and  
7 conduct of Defendants, Plaintiff has been injured and will continue to suffer  
8 irreparable injury to its business and reputation unless Defendants are restrained by  
9 this Court from unfairly competing with Plaintiff.

10 40. Plaintiff has no adequate remedy at law.

11 41. In doing the acts alleged herein, Defendants acted with oppression, fraud  
12 and malice, and in willful and conscious disregard of the rights of Plaintiff, so as to  
13 entitle Plaintiff to exemplary and punitive damages in an amount to be established at  
14 trial.

15 **FOURTH CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

16 **(Violation of 17 U.S.C. §1202 – Against All Defendants, and Each)**

17 42. Plaintiff repeats, re-alleges, and incorporates herein by reference as though  
18 fully set forth, the allegations contained in the preceding paragraphs of this  
19 complaint.

20 43. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants, and  
21 each of them, violated 17 U.S.C. §1202 et seq. by intentionally removing Plaintiff's  
22 attribution and copyright management information from the products at issue and/or  
23 altering the attribution and copyright management information on said works to  
24 reflect that a party other than Plaintiff authored or owned the works. Defendants, and  
25 each of them, engaged in the above acts in creating the infringing works at issue in  
26 this case, and then distributed the mislabeled and misattributed copies of these works  
27 to the public.

1           44. Defendants, and each of them, removed and/or altered the attribution and  
2 copyright management information and distributed the mislabeled and misattributed  
3 copies with knowledge that the copyright management information had been  
4 removed or altered without authority of the copyright owner or the law, and  
5 distributed and publicly displayed the infringing copies knowing that the copyright  
6 management information had been removed or altered without authority of the  
7 copyright owner or the law, and knowing, or, with respect to civil remedies under  
8 § 1203, having reasonable grounds to know, that the conduct would induce, enable,  
9 facilitate, or conceal an infringement of certain rights under this title. In addition,  
10 certain of the infringing copies included alterations and manipulations by  
11 Defendants, and each of them, that appear to attribute or associate one or more of the  
12 Subject Works to Rue 21. These acts further violate §1202.

13           45. Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants,  
14 and each of them, knowingly removed and altered the copyright management  
15 information on the infringing copies. Review of the product images set forth above  
16 reflects the removal of the identifying material.

17           46. Defendants, and each of them, removed Plaintiff's name and  
18 identifying material from Plaintiff's designs in violation of this statute before  
19 publishing unauthorized copies to the public. Defendants, and each of them, further  
20 affixed packing, marketing material, and logos to Plaintiff's designs to attribute the  
21 unauthorized copies to one or more of the Defendants, and then distributed the  
22 unauthorized copies online and through live performance to the public.

23           47. The above conduct is in violation of the Digital Millennium Copyright  
24 Act and exposes Defendants, and each of them, to additional and enhanced common  
25 law and statutory damages and penalties, including in the form of Plaintiff's costs  
26 and attorneys' fees, pursuant to 17 USC § 1203 and other applicable law.

1           48.       Plaintiff is informed and believes and thereon alleges that Defendants,  
2       and each of their, conduct as alleged herein was willful, reckless, and/or with  
3       knowledge, and Plaintiff resultantly seeks enhanced damage and penalties.

4                               **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

5       WHEREFORE, Plaintiff prays for judgment as follows:

6               Against All Defendants and With Respect to Each Claim for Relief

- 7           a.   That Plaintiff be awarded all profits of Defendant plus all losses of  
8               Plaintiff, the exact sum to be proven at the time of trial, or, if elected  
9               before final judgment, statutory damages as available under 17 U.S.C. §  
10              101, *et seq.*;
- 11          b.   A disgorgement of profits and other damages arising from such  
12               infringement, pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1117, and award all damages  
13               called for therein;
- 14          c.   An award of actual damages sustained by Plaintiff;
- 15          d.   That Plaintiff be awarded its attorneys' fees as available under 17 U.S.C.  
16               § 101, *et seq.*, and/or 17 U.S.C. §1203,
- 17          e.   That Plaintiff be awarded pre-judgment interest as allowed by law;
- 18          f.   That Plaintiff be awarded the costs of this action;
- 19          g.   That Plaintiff be awarded actual and punitive damages in an amount  
20               sufficient to deter and punish Defendant, on account of Defendant's  
21               willful violation of Federal, California, and common law; and
- 22          h.   That Plaintiff be awarded such further legal and equitable relief as the  
23               Court deems proper;

24  
25  
26       ///

27       ///

1 Plaintiff demands a **jury trial** pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 38 and the 7<sup>th</sup>  
2 Amendment to the United States Constitution.

3 Respectfully submitted,  
4

5 Dated: April 3, 2017

By: /s/ Scott Alan Burroughs  
6 Scott Alan Burroughs, Esq.  
7 DONIGER / BURROUGHS  
8 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
9 VALFRE, LLC  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28